



REVIEW REPORT 161-2023

Ministry of Corrections, Policing and Public Safety

December 11, 2023

Summary:

The Applicant submitted an access to information request to the Ministry of Corrections, Policing and Public Safety (Corrections). Corrections provided the Applicant redacted records. Corrections cited subsections 15(1)(c), (d), (k), 16(1), 17(1)(a), (b), 19(1)(b), (c)(i), (c)(ii), 22 and 29(1) of *The Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* (FOIP) as its reasons for withholding portions of the records from the Applicant. The Applicant requested a review by the Commissioner. The Commissioner found that 15(1)(c), 16(1), 17(1)(a), (b), 19(1)(b), 22(a), (c) and 29(1) of FOIP applied to some of the portions of the records that Correction applied the exemptions. However, he also found that Corrections did not properly apply exemptions to other portions of the records. Given the large number of records and exemptions cited, the Commissioner set out his findings and recommendations in the Appendix to the Report.

I BACKGROUND

- [1] On January 3, 2023, the Ministry of Corrections, Policing and Public Safety (Corrections) received the following access to information request from the Applicant:

I'm requesting correspondence and reports related to the appointment of Rod Knecht to conduct a review of the Prince Albert Police Service, and the terms of the contract with Knecht and Associates.

- [2] The Applicant specified the time period of January 2021 to January 2023 for the records they were requesting.

- [3] In a letter dated July 5, 2023, Corrections responded to the Applicant. Corrections provided the Applicant access to some records but withheld others, in full and in part. Corrections

cited subsections 15(1)(c), (d), (k), 16(1), 17(1)(a), (b), 19(1)(b), (c)(i), (c)(ii), 22 and 29(1) of *The Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act* (FOIP) as its reasons for refusing the Applicant access to records.

- [4] On July 6, 2023, the Applicant requested a review by my office.
- [5] On August 23, 2023, my office notified Corrections, the Applicant, and the third party, Rod Knecht & Associates Ltd, that my office would be undertaking a review.
- [6] On September 13, 2023, my office received a submission from the third party.
- [7] On November 17, 2023, my office received a submission from Corrections. It also received an “Affidavit of Record” with an attached schedule of records to which Corrections was claiming solicitor-client privilege (subsection 22(a) of FOIP).
- [8] My office did not receive a submission from the Applicant.

II RECORDS AT ISSUE

- [9] At issue are 529 pages of records, some of which were withheld in full or in part. The 529 pages of records are referenced as the “Records at Issue” in the Appendix.
- [10] The Applicant was provided 356 pages of records, some of which were withheld in full in or in part. These 356 pages of records are referenced as the “Records provided to the Applicant”.
- [11] There are pages in the “Records at Issue” that do not appear in the “Records provided to the Applicant”. These pages are marked in the Appendix. Corrections did not offer any explanation as to why these pages appear in the “Records at Issue” but not in the “Records provided to the Applicant”. Further, Corrections did not indicate in its Index of Records what exemptions are being applied to these pages. However, some of these pages appear to be duplicates of pages that appear in the “Records provided to the Applicant”. Therefore,

my office considered the exemptions applied to the duplicates of the missing pages. Where there are no duplicates of the missing pages, I have recommended release of the records.

[12] Throughout this Report, I will be referring to pages in the “Records at Issue”, not the pages in the “Records provided to the Applicant”.

III DISCUSSION OF THE ISSUES

1. Do I have jurisdiction?

[13] Corrections qualifies as a “government institution” pursuant to subsection 2(1)(d)(i) of FOIP. Therefore, I find that I have jurisdiction to undertake this review.

[14] Rod Knecht & Associates Limited qualifies as a “third party” pursuant to subsection 2(1)(j) of FOIP.

2. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP?

[15] Corrections applied subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP to pages 8 to 13, 31 to 36, 47 to 50, 53 to 56, 63 to 66, 71 to 74, 93 to 99, 142 to 145, 162 to 165, 181 to 186, 192 to 195, 201 to 204, 220, 223, 225 to 226, 269 to 272, 372 to 375, 380 to 383, 387 to 390, 396 to 399, 406 to 409, 418 to 420, 439 to 442, 444 to 445, and 491 to 494 of the “Records at Issue”. These pages appear to be copies of the Minister’s Order, the attached schedule to the Minister’s Order, and the Notice of Special Inquiry. Also, Corrections applied subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP to page 97 of the “Records at Issue” (or page 70 of the “Records provided to the Applicant”), which is a letter to the Chairperson of the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners. I will deal with the Minister’s Order (and the attached Minister’s Order), and the Notice of Special Inquiry separately from the letter to the Chairperson of the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners.

[16] Subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP provides:

15(1) A head may refuse to give access to a record, the release of which could:

...

(c) interfere with a lawful investigation or disclose information with respect to a lawful investigation;

[17] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP applies:

1. Does the government institution's activity qualify as a "lawful investigation"?
2. Does one of the following exist?
 - a) Could the release of the information interfere with a lawful investigation?
 - b) Could the release disclose information with respect to a lawful investigation?

(*Guide to FOIP*, Chapter 4: "Exemptions from the Right of Access", Updated October 18, 2023 [*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4], pp. 53-54)

[18] Below is the analysis to determine if subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.

1. Does the government institution's activity qualify as a "lawful investigation"?

[19] A "lawful investigation" is an investigation that is authorized or required and permitted by law. The government institution should identify the legislation under which the investigation is occurring. The investigation can be concluded, active and ongoing or be occurring in the future (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 53).

[20] In its submission, Corrections asserted that the records contain information regarding a special inquiry. Based on a review, my office noted that the records to which Corrections applied subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP is regarding the commencement of an inquiry pursuant to section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990*.

[21] In my office's [Review Report 030-2020, 050-2020](#), I had found that an inspection or inquiry under *The Northern Municipalities Act* (NMA) would qualify as a "lawful investigation" for the purposes of subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP. This is because the person appointed to conduct the inquiry was provided powers set out in *The Public Inquiries Act*,

2013. I had found that *The Public Inquiries Act, 2013* provides powers that are consistent with those of an “investigation”.

[22] Similarly, I find that an inquiry pursuant to section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* qualifies as a lawful investigation for the purposes of subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP. The first part of the two-part test is met.

2. Does one of the following exist?

a) Could the release of the information interfere with a lawful investigation?

b) Could the release disclose information with respect to a lawful investigation?

[23] To meet the second part of the test, it is only necessary for the government institution to demonstrate that either the release of the information could interfere with a lawful investigation, or the release of the information could disclose information with respect to a lawful investigation. In its submission, Corrections asserted that the release of the records would disclose information with respect to a lawful investigation.

[24] “With respect to” are words of the widest possible scope; the phrase is probably the widest of any expression intended to convey some connection between two related subject matters (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 54).

[25] Section 15 of FOIP uses the word “could” versus “could reasonably be expected to” as seen in other provisions of FOIP. The threshold for “could” is somewhat lower than a reasonable expectation. The requirement for “could” is simply that the release of the information “could” have the specified result. There would still have to be a basis for asserting the outcome could occur. If it is fanciful or exceedingly remote, the exemption should not be invoked (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 55).

[26] Based on a review, my office found that the Minister’s Order (and the attached schedule) and the notice of special inquiry could disclose information with respect to the inquiry, including the scope of the inquiry. Therefore, these records meet the second part of the

two-part test. I find that subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP applies to the Minister's Order (the attached schedule) and the notice of special inquiry.

[27] I should note that in their correspondence with my office, the Applicant had asserted that there is a public interest in these records. There is no general public interest override in FOIP. However, I note that section 91 of *The Police Act, 1990* provides as follows:

91 Unless otherwise directed by the authority conducting the inquiry, an inquiry conducted pursuant to section 88, 89 or 90 is to be open to the public.

[28] Presumably, an inquiry conducted pursuant to section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* is to be open to the public given the public interest in public safety "unless otherwise directed by the authority conducting the inquiry". Based on the evidence before me, it appears the inquiry proceedings were not to be open to the public.

[29] Section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* gives Corrections the discretion for it to open the inquiry to the public. Similarly, since subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP is a discretionary exemption, there is discretion for the head of Corrections to release the Minister's Order (and the attached schedule) and the notice of special inquiry to the Applicant. I recommend that the head of Corrections reconsider the exercise of their discretion regarding the Minister's Order (and the attached schedule) and the notice of special inquiry to the Applicant within 30 days of issuance of this Report.

[30] Regarding the letter to the Chairperson of the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners (page 97 of the Records at Issue), I find that the release of the letter would not reveal information with respect to the inquiry. This letter does not meet the second part of the two-part test. I should also note that this letter was released to another applicant by the Prince Albert Police Service (PAPS), as described in the background of my office's [Review Report 250-2022](#):

[2] In a letter dated December 13, 2022, PAPS responded to the Applicant by saying it would provide one record to the Applicant but withhold another. PAPS said:

1. There has been no such notice served on the Prince Albert Police Service. We are therefore unable to provide you with such a document, as requested.
2. There has been no such notice served in respect of an independent, external review of the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners. We are therefore unable to provide you with such a document, as requested.
3. **In response to your request, attached please find a copy of a letter dated November 8, 2022 sent to the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners by the Minister of Corrections, Policing and Public Safety giving the Board notice of a special inquiry to be conducted pursuant to s. 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* pertaining to the operation and administration of the Prince Albert Police Service.**
4. You will note the reference in the November 8, 2022 letter (attached per #3 above) to an “attached notice of special inquiry”. After some review of the content and terms upon which that document has been delivered to the Board of Police Commissioners, and consultation with third party officials from whom the document was received, we would report to you that we must decline access to this particular document at this time in that the LAFOIP legislation requires and authorizes that we refrain from disclosing its contents. In this regard we refer to and are governed by the following reasons and legislation:...

[Emphasis added]

[31] Since the letter has already been released to a member of the public by PAPS, I recommend that Corrections release the letter that appears on page 97 of the Records at Issue to the Applicant. I note that this letter also appears at pages 139, 180, 224, and 443 of the Records at Issue. However, Corrections did not cite subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP as a reason for withholding those pages. Instead, it cited subsections 15(1)(d) and 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Nevertheless, since the letter has already been released by PAPS, I recommend that Corrections also release the letter to the Applicant within 30 days of issuance of this Report.

3. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP?

[32] Where Corrections applied subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP, it also applied subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP. I have found subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP applied to all of the records except for page 97 of the Records at Issue.

[33] Subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP provides:

15(1) A head may refuse to give access to a record, the release of which could:

...

(k) interfere with a law enforcement matter or disclose information respecting a law enforcement matter;

[34] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP applies:

1. Is there a law enforcement matter involved?
2. Does one of the following exist?
 - a) Could the release of information interfere with a law enforcement matter?
 - b) Could the release disclose information with respect to a law enforcement matter?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, pp. 78-79)

[35] Below is the analysis to determine if subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP applies.

1. Is there a law enforcement matter involved?

[36] Law enforcement includes investigations, inspections or proceedings conducted under the authority of or for the purpose of enforcing an enactment which leads to or could lead to a penalty or sanction being imposed under the enactment (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, at p. 78*).

[37] “Investigation” has been defined, in general, as a systematic process of examination, inquiry and observations (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, at p. 78*).

[38] “Inspection” has been defined, in general, as a careful examination (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, at p. 79*).

[39] Earlier, I found that an inquiry pursuant to section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* qualifies as a “lawful investigation” for the purpose of subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP. Since law

enforcement includes investigations, I find that the inquiry pursuant to section 88 of *The Police Act, 1990* qualifies as a law enforcement matter for the purpose of subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP. The first part of the two-part test is met.

2. Does one of the following exist?

a) Could the release of information interfere with a law enforcement matter?

b) Could the release disclose information with respect to a law enforcement matter?

[40] Earlier, in my analysis of subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP, I found the release of the letter at page 97 would not reveal information with respect to the inquiry. Similarly, I find the release of the letter at page 97 would not disclose information with respect to a law enforcement matter. Therefore, the second part of the two-part test is not met. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP to page 97 of the Records at Issue.

4. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP?

[41] Corrections applied subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP to pages 85 to 90, 108 to 113, 121 to 123, 139 to 141, 146 to 148, 152 to 157, 180, 187 to 189, 196 to 197, 205 to 206, 208 to 209, 212 to 217, 224, 287 to 289, 343 to 346, 350 to 353, 355 to 357, 391 to 392, 400 to 401, 421 to 422, 427 to 428, 431 to 436, 443, 497 to 498, 508 to 509 of the Records at Issue. These pages, with the exception of pages 343 to 344 of the Records at Issue, are copies of the 1) Confidentiality Agreement between the Government of Saskatchewan and Rod Knecht & Associates Ltd. and 2) Indemnification Agreement between Rod Knecht & Associates Ltd. and the Government of Saskatchewan.

[42] I will discuss pages 343 to 344 of the Records at Issue after the analysis of whether subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP applies to the Confidentiality Agreement and the Indemnification Agreement.

[43] Subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP provides:

15(1) A head may refuse to give access to a record, the release of which could:

...

(d) be injurious to the Government of Saskatchewan or a government institution in the conduct of existing or anticipated legal proceedings;

[44] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP applies:

1. Do the proceedings qualify as existing or anticipated legal proceedings?
2. Could disclosure of the records be injurious to the government institution in the conduct of the legal proceedings?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 57)

[45] Below is the analysis to determine if subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP applies.

1. Do the proceedings qualify as existing or anticipated legal proceedings?

[46] “Legal proceedings” are any civil or criminal proceeding or inquiry in which evidence is or may be given, and includes an arbitration. It includes proceedings governed by rules of court or rules of judicial or quasi-judicial tribunals that can result in a judgement of a court or a ruling by a tribunal. Legal proceedings include all proceedings authorized or sanctioned by law, and brought or instituted in a court or legal tribunal, for the acquiring of a right or the enforcement of a remedy (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 57*).

[47] To qualify for this exemption, the legal proceedings must be “existing or anticipated” as the provision uses these terms. “Anticipated” means more than merely possible (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 57*).

[48] In its submission, Corrections said that the Indemnification Agreement “is a document prepared in anticipation of legal proceedings as it sets out the defence and/or settlement approach the Ministry would take in the event of legal against the Inquiry Officer”. It then said that the Confidentiality Agreement “was prepared to ensure any sensitive government

information which could be used in anticipated legal proceedings would not be disclosed” by the third party.

[49] Corrections has not identified any existing or anticipated legal proceedings. Anticipated proceedings must mean more than mere possibility. In the past, public bodies have provided my office with documentation to demonstrate legal proceedings were existing or anticipated, such as a Statement of Claim ([Review Report 210-2017](#) at paragraph [11]) or Notice to Compel Disclosure ([Review Report 020-2023](#) at paragraph [14]). Corrections has not done so. The first part of the test is not met. Therefore, I find that Corrections has not properly applied subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP to pages 85 to 90, 108 to 113, 121 to 123, 139 to 141, 146 to 148, 152 to 157, 180, 187 to 189, 196 to 197, 205 to 206, 208 to 209, 212 to 217, 224, 287 to 289, 345 to 346, 350 to 353, 355 to 357, 391 to 392, 400 to 401, 421 to 422, 427 to 428, 431 to 436, 443, 497 to 498, 508 to 509 of the Records at Issue. My findings and recommendations are set out in the Appendix.

[50] Pages 343 to 344 of the Records at Issue (which are pages 241 to 242 of the records provided to the Applicant) is a copy of a letter dated November 8, 2022 to Rod Knecht & Associates. Curiously, a copy of this letter at pages 91 to 92 of the Records at Issue (or page 64 of the Records provided to the Applicant) has already been disclosed to the Applicant with only an email address appearing at the header redacted pursuant to subsection 29(1) of FOIP. Therefore, I recommend that Corrections disclose pages 343 to 344 of the Records at Issue similar to how it disclosed pages 91 to 92 within 30 days of issuance of this Report.

5. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP?

[51] Corrections applied subsection 16(1) of FOIP to pages 103, 230, and 449 of the Records at Issue. Subsection 16(1) of FOIP is a mandatory class-based provision. Subsections 16(1)(a) through (d) of FOIP are not an exhaustive list. Therefore, even if none of the subsections are found to apply, the introductory wording of subsection 16(1) of FOIP must still be considered. In other words, is the information a confidence of Executive Council?

[52] Nonetheless, in its submission, Corrections noted it was relying on subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP to refuse access.

[53] Subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP provides as follows:

16(1) A head shall refuse to give access to a record that discloses a confidence of the Executive Council, including:

(a) records created to present advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options to the Executive Council or any of its committees;

...

[54] The two-part test my office uses to determine if subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP applies is as follows:

1. Does the record contain advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options?
2. Was the record created to present to Cabinet or any of its committees?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, pp. 99-101)

[55] Below is the analysis to determine if subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP applies.

1. Does the record contain advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options?

[56] A recommendation is a specific piece of advice about what to do, especially when given officially; a suggestion that someone should choose a particular thing or person that one thinks particularly good or meritorious. Recommendations relate to a suggested course of action more explicitly and pointedly than “advice”. It can include material that relates to a suggested course of action that will ultimately be accepted or rejected by the person being advised. It includes suggestions for a course of action as well as the rationale or substance for a suggested course of action. A recommendation, whether express or inferable, is still a recommendation (*Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 100*).

[57] Based on a review, the portion redacted on pages 103, 230, and 449 of the Records at Issue pursuant to subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP contains a recommendation. The first part of the two-part test is met.

2. Was the record created to present to Cabinet or any of its committees?

[58] “Executive Council” means the Executive Council appointed pursuant to *The Executive Government Administration Act*. It consists of the Premier and Cabinet Ministers. Executive Council is also referred to as “Cabinet”. Cabinet has also been defined as the committee of senior ministers (heading individual provincial government ministries) which acts collectively with the Premier to decide matters of government policy (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 102).

[59] Based on a review, the recommendation that appears on pages 103, 230, and 449 of the Records at Issue is a recommendation that is for Cabinet. Therefore, I find the second part of the two-part test is met.

[60] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 103, 230, and 449 of the Records at Issue.

6. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP?

[61] Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 4 to 5, 8 to 19, 22, 25 to 27, 31 to 41, 43 to 45, 47 to 52, 71 to 77, 100 to 104, 116, 131, 139 to 145, 149, 162 to 165, 180, 183 to 186, 190, 192 to 195, 199, 201 to 204, 208 to 209, 220 to 223, 224, 227 to 230, 232 to 233, 236 to 237, 240, 243 to 244, 248 to 249, 252, 257, 259, 262 to 263, 265 to 268, 273 to 281, 283 to 289, 343 to 344, 355 to 357, 369 to 370, 372 to 378, 380 to 385, 387 to 390, 393 to 394, 396 to 399, 403 to 404, 406 to 411, 414 to 417, 421 to 425, 439 to 443, 446 to 449, 452, 456, 461, 463, 468, 470 to 471, 473, 476, 478, 481, 485 to 486, 490 to 498, and 502 to 504 of the Records at Issue.

[62] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies:

1. Does the information qualify as advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options?
2. Was the advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses and/or policy options developed by or for a government institution or a member of the Executive Council?

(*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, pp. 125-128)

[63] Pages 125 to 127 of Chapter 4 of the *Guide to FOIP* defines advice, proposals, analyses and policy options as follows:

- “Advice” is guidance offered by one person to another. It can include the analysis of a situation or issue that may require action and the presentation of options for future action, but not the presentation of facts. Advice encompasses material that permits the drawing of inferences with respect to a suggested course of action, but which does not itself make a specific recommendation. It can be an implied recommendation. The “pros and cons” of various options also qualify as advice. It should not be given a restricted meaning. Rather, it should be interpreted to include an opinion that involves exercising judgement and skill in weighing the significance of fact. It includes expert opinion on matters of fact on which a government institution must make a decision for future action.
- A “proposal” is something offered for consideration or acceptance.
- “Analyses” (or analysis) is the detailed examination of the elements or structure of something; the process of separating something into its constituent elements.
- “Policy options” are lists of alternative courses of action to be accepted or rejected in relation to a decision that is to be made. They would include matters such as the public servant’s identification and consideration of alternative decisions that could be made. In other words, they constitute an evaluative analysis as opposed to objective information.
- “Developed by or for” means the advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses and/or policy options must have been created either: 1) within the government institution, or 2) outside the government institution but for the government institution and at its request (for example, by a service provider or stakeholder).

- [64] I have already defined the term “recommendation” and “Executive Council” in my analysis of subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP.
- [65] Pages 19, 22, 116, 232 to 233, 236 to 237, 240, 243 to 244, 248 to 249, 252, 257, 452, 457, 461, 464, 468, 470 to 471, 473, 476, 478, 481, and 485 to 486 of the Records at Issue contains email exchanges between a Correction’s employee (a Media Relations Consultant) and several other Correction employees, including the Deputy Minister. The Media Relations Consultant proposed responses to media inquiries. Therefore, I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 19, 22, 116, 232 to 233, 236 to 237, 240, 243 to 244, 248 to 249, 252, 257, 452, 457, 461, 464, 468, 470 to 471, 473, 476, 478, 481, and 485 to 486 of the Records at Issue. My findings and recommendations are set out in the Appendix.
- [66] Further, pages 262 to 263 of the Records at Issue contain an email from the Deputy Minister to the Assistant Deputy Minister and an Executive Director. The Deputy Minister sought advice. I find that the responses from the Assistant Deputy Minister and Executive Director on these pages qualify as “advice” by employees of Correction. Therefore, I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 262 to 263 of the Records at Issue.
- [67] However, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to a large number of pages that do not contain advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options. For example, it applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to drafts of documents at pages 8 to 15, 16 to 18, 31 to 38, 39 to 41, 47 to 50, 53 to 58, 63 to 66, 71 to 74, 75 to 77, 140 to 141, 142 to 145, 162 to 165, 183 to 186, 192 to 195, 201 to 204, 208 to 209, 220 to 223, 287 to 289, 355 to 357, 369 to 370, 372 to 375, 380 to 383, 387 to 390, 396 to 399, 406 to 409, 414 to 417, 421 to 425, 439 to 442, and 491 to 498, 502 and 504 of the Records at Issue. Further, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to drafts of documents (not drafts of advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses and/or policy options) copied and pasted into emails at pages 4, 5, 26, 27, 67 to 69, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 280, 284 to 286, and 410 to 411 of the Records at Issue. However, as I have stated in previous reports (see [Review Report 002-2020](#) at paragraph [18] and [Review Report 141-2023](#) at paragraph [70])

the Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Alberta (AB IPC) said in its Order F2016-016 the following:

[para 75] There is no evidence that the letter reflects the deliberations of the councillor as to what the letter should say. As I noted in Order F2013-17, **the fact that a draft (assuming the letter is a draft and not the final version) may differ from a final version of does not transform the information in the draft into advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses, policy options, consultations or deliberations: information must have that character to begin with.** I acknowledge that the differences between a draft version and a final version may allow a reader to determine what was changed and to speculate about the reasons for the changes. However, it does not follow from this possibility that any changes that were made are the result of information subject to section 24(1)(a) or (b), or that such information would be revealed by disclosing the draft version.

[Emphasis added]

[68] It appears that Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages that contained drafts of documents, and not drafts of advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses and/or policy options. That is not enough to meet the first part of the two-part test. Therefore, I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages set out in the last paragraph.

[69] Similarly, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to copies of letters (drafts and final versions) addressed to the Chairperson of the Prince Albert Board of Police Commissioners and to the person appointed to conduct the inquiry at pages 139, 199, 180, 224, 277, 282, 343 to 344, 443, and 490 of the Records at Issue. Based on a review of these pages, there is no content that qualifies as advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 139, 199, 180, 224, 277, 282, 343 to 344, 443, and 490 of the Records at Issue.

[70] Also, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to a document that contained background information on pages 100 to 103, 227 to 230, and 446 to 449 of the Records at Issue. Based on a review, these pages do not contain advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options. Therefore, I find that Corrections did not properly apply

subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 100 to 103, 227 to 230, and 446 to 449 of the Records at Issue.

[71] Further, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to portions of email exchanges between itself and the person appointed to conduct the inquiry at pages 43, 44, 45, 59 to 62, 104, 149, 190, 369 to 370, 376 to 378, 384 to 385, 393 to 394, 403 to 404 of the Records at Issue. The emails were regarding the drafting and signing agreements between Corrections and the appointee. The contents appear to be Corrections asking the appointee for their preference and for information in order to finalize the agreements. Such information does not qualify as advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 43, 44, 45, 59 to 62, 104, 149, 190, 369 to 370, 376 to 378, 384 to 385, 393 to 394, 403 to 404 of the Records at Issue.

[72] Finally, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to contents within emails in the Records at Issue as described as follows:

- Page 25 contains an email where the redacted portion is a description of the email attachments.
- Page 259 contains an email where the redacted portion is a file path on a Windows system on where documents are stored.
- Pages 265, 266, 273 to 274, 278 to 279, and 283 contains an email by the Chief of Staff to the Minister that provides direction to an employee (or next steps).

[73] Based on a review of the emails described above, the contents do not qualify as advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 25, 259, 265, 266, 273 to 274, 278 to 279, and 283 of the Records at Issue.

[74] My findings and recommendations are set out in the Appendix.

7. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP?

[75] Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 3 to 5, 26 to 27, 44 to 45, 51, 59 to 62, 67 to 69, 104, 116, 131, 149, 165, 236, 243 to 244, 248, 262 to 263, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 281, 284 to 286, 368 to 370, 376 to 378, 284 to 285, 393 to 394, 402 to 404, 410 to 411, 452, 457, 461, 464, 468, 470 to 471, 473, 476, 478, 481, and 485 to 486 of the Records at Issue.

[76] I have already found that subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to some of the pages listed above. Therefore, I will not consider those pages here.

[77] Subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP provides:

17(1) Subject to subsection (2), a head may refuse to give access to a record that could reasonably be expected to disclose:

...

(b) consultations or deliberations involving:

- (i) officers or employees of a government institution;
- (ii) a member of the Executive Council; or
- (iii) the staff of a member of the Executive Council;

[78] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP applies:

1. Does the record contain consultations or deliberations?
2. Do the consultations or deliberations involve officers or employees of a government institution, a member of the Executive Council, or the staff of a member of the Executive Council?

(*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, pp. 133-135)

[79] Pages 133 to 135 of Chapter 4 of the *Guide to FOIP* provides definitions for the following terms:

- “Consultation” means the action of consulting or taking counsel together: deliberation, conference; a conference in which the parties consult and deliberate. A consultation can occur when the views of one or more officers or employees of a government institution are sought as to the appropriateness of a particular proposal or suggested action. It can include consultations about prospective future actions and outcomes in response to a developing situation. It can also include past courses of action. For example, where an employer is considering what to do with an employee in the future, what has been done in the past can be summarized and would qualify as part of the consultation or deliberation.
- “Deliberation” means the action of deliberating (to deliberate: to weigh in mind; to consider carefully with a view to a decision; to think over); careful consideration with a view to a decision; A deliberation can occur when there is a discussion or consideration of the reasons for or against an action. It can refer to discussions conducted with a view towards making a decision.
- “Involving” means including.
- “Officers or employees of a government institution”: “Employee of a government institution” means an individual employed by a government institution and includes an individual retained under a contract to perform services for the government institution.
- “The staff of a member of the Executive Council”: The phrase includes the staff in a Minister’s office, such as Chief of Staff, Administrative Assistants and Ministerial Assistants. It also includes the staff of the Office of the Executive Council.

[80] Pages 131, 262, and 263 of the Records at Issue contain an email timestamped 7:44AM where the Deputy Minister is seeking advice from the Assistant Deputy Minister and an Executive Director. I find that the body of this email qualifies as a “consultation”. I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 17(1)(b)(i) of FOIP to pages 131, 262, and 263 of the Records at Issue.

[81] However, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages that do not contain consultations or deliberations. For example, it applied the exemption to drafts of documents at pages 4, 5, 26, 27, 67 to 69, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 281, 284 to 286, and 410 to 411 of the Records at Issue. These pages are merely drafts. Earlier, I noted that simply because something is in a draft version does not automatically transform the content to consultations or deliberations. Therefore, I find that Corrections did not properly apply

subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 4, 5, 26, 27, 67 to 69, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 281, 284 to 286, and 410 to 411 of the Records at Issue.

[82] The exception is page 165 of the Records at Issue upon which Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP. It is a draft of the Schedule to be attached to the Minister's Order. Contained within this draft are two questions written in red. On the face of the record, it is unclear who the author of these two questions is. However, the author appears to be seeking advice. Therefore, these questions appear to qualify as "consultations". However, without knowing who the author of the questions is and to whom these questions are directed, the second part of the two-part test is not met. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to page 165.

[83] Also, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 44, 45, 51, 60 to 62, 368 to 370, 376 to 378, 384 to 385, 393 to 394, and 403 to 404 of the Records at Issues. These pages contain email exchanges between Corrections and the person appointed to conduct the inquiry. As I have described before, these email exchanges appear to be Corrections asking the appointee for their preference and for information in order to finalize the agreement. Such information does not qualify as consultations or deliberations. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 44, 45, 51, 60 to 62, 368 to 370, 376 to 378, 384 to 385, 393 to 394, and 403 to 404 of the Records at Issues.

[84] Finally, Corrections applied subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to contents within emails in the Records at Issue as described as follows:

- Page 3 contains an email where the redacted portion is a description of the email attachments.
- Pages 59, 368, and 402 contains an email where the redacted portion contains a request from the appointee.
- Pages 104 and 149 contains an email where the redacted portion contains a statement by the appointee.

[85] Based on a review of the emails described above, the contents do not qualify as consultations or deliberations. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 3, 59, 104, 149, 368, and 402 of the Records at Issue.

8. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP?

[86] Corrections applied subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 131, 262, and 263 of the Records at Issue. These pages contain an email dated October 20, 2022 (timestamped 1:42pm). The author of the email is the third party. The redacted contents is regarding the hourly rate they charge a client of theirs.

[87] Subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP provides:

19(1) Subject to Part V and this section, a head shall refuse to give access to a record that contains:

...

(b) financial, commercial, scientific, technical or labour relations information that is supplied in confidence, implicitly or explicitly, to a government institution by a third party;

[88] My office uses the following three-part test to determine if subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP applies:

1. Is the information financial, commercial, scientific, technical or labour relations information of a third party?
2. Was the information supplied by the third party to a government institution?
3. Was the information supplied in confidence implicitly or explicitly?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, pp. 201-205)

[89] Below is my analysis to determine if subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP applies.

- 1. Is the information financial, commercial, scientific, technical or labour relations information of a third party?***

[90] Page 201 of Chapter 4 of the *Guide to FOIP* provides:

- “Financial information” is information regarding monetary resources, such as financial capabilities, assets and liabilities, past or present. Common examples are financial forecasts, investment strategies, budgets, and profit and loss statements. The financial information must be specific to a third party.
- “Commercial information” is information relating to the buying, selling or exchange of merchandise or services. This can include third party associations, past history, references and insurance policies and pricing structures, market research, business plans, and customer records.

[91] In its submission, Corrections asserted that the redacted information qualifies as “commercial information”.

[92] In their submission, the third party asserted the redacted information qualifies as “financial information”.

[93] While the third party asserted the information qualifies as “financial information”, I note that I have found that hourly rates of third parties qualify as commercial information (see [Review Report 007-2015](#) at paragraph [24]; [Review Report 181-2022, 182-2022](#) at paragraph [114]). Therefore, the first part of the test is met.

2. Was the information supplied by the third party to a government institution?

[94] Page 203 of Chapter 4 of my office’s *Guide to FOIP* defines “supplied” as being provided or furnished. Information may qualify as “supplied” if it was directly supplied to a government institution by a third party, or where its disclosure would reveal or permit the drawing of accurate inferences with respect to information supplied by a third party.

[95] In its submission, Corrections asserted that the information was sent by email by the third party to it.

[96] In their submission, the third party indicated that they provided the information to Corrections as a reference point for financial discussions and the subsequent awarding of contract(s).

[97] While I have said in the past the contents of a contract involving a government institution will not normally qualify as having been supplied by a third party, the information at issue is not the content of a contract. Based on a review of the email, it does appear that the information was supplied by the third party to Corrections, as the third party has asserted. I find that the second part of the three-part test is met.

3. Was the information supplied in confidence implicitly or explicitly?

[98] Page 205 of Chapter 4 of the *Guide to FOIP* provides the following definitions:

- “In confidence” usually describes a situation of mutual trust in which private matters are relayed or reported. Information obtained in confidence means that the supplier of the information has stipulated how the information can be disseminated. In order for confidence to be found, there must be an implicit or explicit agreement or understanding of confidentiality on the part of both the government institution and the third party providing the information.
- “Implicitly” means that the confidentiality is understood even though there is no actual statement of confidentiality, agreement, or other physical evidence of the understanding that the information will be kept confidential.
- “Explicitly” means that the request for confidentiality has been clearly expressed, distinctly stated or made definite. There may be documentary evidence that shows that the information was supplied on the understanding that it would be kept confidential.

[99] In its submission, Corrections asserted that the third party supplied the information to help government officials determine if the third party should be appointed as the Inquiry Officer. It asserted that information provided in this context is ordinarily kept in confidence.

[100] In their submission, the third party asserted that the information was supplied in confidence implicitly.

[101] Factors considered when determining if information was supplied in confidence implicitly include:

- What is the nature of the information? Would a reasonable person regard it as confidential? Would it ordinarily be kept confidential by the third party or the government institution?
- Was the information treated consistently in a manner that indicated a concern for its protection by the third party and the government institution from the point at which it was supplied until the present time?
- Is the information available from sources to which the public has access?
- Does the government institution have any internal policies or procedures that speak to how records such as the one in question are to be handled confidentially?
- Was there a mutual understanding that the information would be held in confidence?

[102] Based on a review, the information was supplied prior to the awarding of the contract. As the third party asserted, it was used as a reference point in its discussions with Corrections. Given the circumstances in which the third party supplied the information, it would be reasonable for a person to regard such information be kept confidential.

[103] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP to the redacted contents of the email dated October 20, 2022 (timestamped 1:42pm) on pages 131, 262, and 263 of the Records at Issue. I recommend that Correction continue to withhold the redacted contents in the email dated October 20, 2022 (timestamped 1:42pm). See the Appendix for my findings and recommendations.

[104] Since Corrections applied subsection 19(1)(c)(i) and (ii) of FOIP to the same contents it applied subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP, and I have found that subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP applies, I do not have to determine if subsection 19(1)(c)(i) and (ii) of FOIP applies.

9. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 22(a) of FOIP?

[105] Corrections applied subsection 22(a) of FOIP to pages 3, 25, 118, 166, 266, 273, 278, 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 511 to 516, 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue.

[106] I will consider page 166 in my analysis of subsection 22(c) of FOIP later in this Report.

[107] Before I proceed, I note two things in Correction's submission regarding subsection 22(a) of FOIP. First, I note that Corrections indicated that it applied subsection 22(a) of FOIP in error to page 118 of the Records at Issue (page 91 of the records provided to the Applicant). It says that this page can be released to the Applicant.

[108] Second, Corrections indicated it "objects to producing the records listed in Schedule A of the Affidavit of Record on the grounds of solicitor client privilege". However, it provided my office with a copy of the records.

[109] Subsection 22(a) of FOIP provides:

22 A head may refuse to give access to a record that:

(a) contains any information that is subject to any privilege that is available at law, including solicitor-client privilege;

[110] My office uses the following three-part test to determine if subsection 22(a) of FOIP applies:

1. Is the record a communication between solicitor and client?
2. Does the communication entail the seeking or giving of legal advice?
3. Did the parties intend for the communication to be treated confidentially?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, pp. 260-263)

[111] Below is an analysis to determine if subsection 22(a) of FOIP applies.

1. Is the record a communication between solicitor and client?

[112] Pages 260 to 263 of Chapter 4 of my office's *Guide to FOIP* provides the following definitions:

- A "communication" is the process of bringing an idea to another's perception; the message or ideas so expressed or exchanged; the interchange of messages or ideas by speech, writing, gestures or conduct.
- "Client" means a person who consults a lawyer and on whose behalf the lawyer renders or agrees to render legal services; or having consulted the lawyer, reasonably concludes that the lawyer has agreed to render legal services on his or her behalf; and includes a client of the law firm of which the lawyer is a partner or associate, whether or not the lawyer handles the client's work.
- "Lawyer" means a member of the Law Society and includes a law student registered in the Society's pre-call training program.

[113] Based on a review of the records to which Corrections applied subsection 22(a) of FOIP, pages 290 to 340 of the Records at Issue are email exchanges (with attachments) between Corrections employees (client) and legal counsel from the Ministry of Justice and Attorney General (solicitor). Therefore, pages 290 to 340 of the Records at Issue meet the first part of the three-part test.

[114] Similarly, pages 488 to 500 of the Records at Issue are email exchanges (with attachments) between a Corrections employee (client) to legal counsel from the Ministry of Justice (solicitor). Therefore, pages 488 to 500 of the Records at Issue meet the first part of the three-part test.

[115] Finally, pages 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue is a duplicate of the email at page 488 to 500. Therefore, pages 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue meet the first part of the three-part test.

[116] However, the following are pages where the record is not a communication between solicitor and client:

- Pages 3, 25, 266, 273, 278 is an email dated November 4, 2022 from the Executive Advisor to the Deputy Minister to the Chief of the Staff to the Minister. The redacted sentence is a description of the email attachments. The redacted contents is not a communication between solicitor and client.
- Pages 511 to 516 are attachments to an email from a Senior Administrative Assistant within the Deputy Minister's Office to the Executive Advisor to the Deputy Minister. Therefore, these pages are not a communication between solicitor and client.

[117] Therefore, I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(a) of FOIP to pages 3, 25, 118, 266, 273, 278, 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.

[118] I will continue to determine if pages 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue meet the second part of the three-part test.

2. Does the communication entail the seeking or giving of legal advice?

[119] "Legal advice" means a legal opinion about a legal issue, and a recommended course of action, based on legal considerations, regarding a matter with legal implications (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 261).

[120] The scope of solicitor-client privilege is broad. It applies to all communications made with a view of obtaining legal advice. If a communication falls somewhere within the continuum of that necessary exchange of information, the object of which is the giving or receiving of legal advice, it is protected by solicitor-client privilege (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, pp. 260-261).

[121] Pages 290 to 340 are email exchanges between Corrections employees and legal counsel from the Ministry of Justice and Attorney General regarding the drafting of key messages. Based on a review, the Corrections employees provided drafts and edits to the key messages to legal counsel and sought legal advice from legal counsel. Then, legal counsel provided suggested changes for the Correction employees' consideration. Therefore, these pages meet the second part of the test.

[122] Similarly, pages 488 to 500 are email exchanges between Correction's employees and legal counsel from the Ministry of Justice regarding the drafting of several documents, including key messages, notice of inquiry, Minister's Order, the letter to the person appointed to conduct the inquiry, and confidentiality agreement. The Corrections employee requests legal advice. Legal counsel provides legal advice. Therefore, these pages meet the second part of the test.

[123] Finally, as I have said before, pages 517 to 529 are duplicates of an email and attachments from pages 488 to 500. As such, pages 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue meet the second part of the test.

3. *Did the parties intend for the communication to be treated confidentially?*

[124] There must be an expectation on the part of the government institution that the communication will be confidential. "Not every aspect of relations between a lawyer and a client is necessarily confidential". Conduct which is inconsistent with an expectation of confidentiality can constitute a waiver of privilege. Confidentiality is the *sine qua non* of privilege. Without confidentiality there can be no privilege and when confidentiality ends so too should the privilege.

[125] While I note that "key messages" are meant to be communicated to the public, I note that pages 290 to 340 are communications between Corrections employees and legal counsel, where legal advice was sought and given, to ensure accuracy of the key messages. I am satisfied that the parties intended for the communications to be treated confidentially.

[126] Similarly, it appears that the email exchanges on pages 488 to 500 are communications between Corrections employees and legal counsel, where legal advice was sought and given, to ensure the accuracy of documents. I am satisfied that the parties intended for the communications to be treated confidentially.

[127] Finally, since pages 517 to 529 are duplicates of the email exchange on pages 488 to 500, then I find the third part of the test is met for these pages too.

[128] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 22(a) of FOIP to pages 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue. See the Appendix for my findings and recommendations.

10. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 22(b) of FOIP?

[129] Corrections applied subsection 22(b) of FOIP to pages 166, 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 511 to 516, and 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue.

[130] Earlier, I have already found that subsection 22(a) of FOIP applies to pages 290 to 340, 488 to 500, and pages 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue, so I do not need to consider those pages. Further, I will consider pages 166 in my analysis of subsection 22(c) of FOIP later in this Report. As such I will only consider whether subsection 22(b) of FOIP applies to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.

[131] Subsection 22(b) of FOIP provides:

22 A head may refuse to give access to a record that:

...

(b) was prepared by or for an agent of the Attorney General for Saskatchewan or legal counsel for a government institution in relation to a matter involving the provision of advice or other services by the agent or legal counsel;

[132] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 22(b) of FOIP applies:

1. Were the records “prepared by or for” an agent or legal counsel for a government institution?
2. Were the records prepared in relation to a matter involving the provision of advice or other services by the agent or legal counsel?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 288)

[133] Below is an analysis to determine if subsection 22(b) of FOIP applies.

1. Were the records “prepared by or for” an agent or legal counsel for a government institution?

[134] The record must be “prepared”, as the term is understood, in relation to the advice or services or compiled or created for the purpose of providing the advice or services (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 288).

[135] “Prepared” means to be made ready for use or consideration (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 288).

[136] “By or for” means the person preparing the record must be either the person providing the legal advice or legal service or a person who is preparing the record in question on behalf of, or, for the use of, the provider of legal advice or legal related services (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 288).

[137] Corrections did not provide an argument as to how subsection 22(b) of FOIP applies to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue. Therefore, I need to determine on the face of the records if subsection 22(b) of FOIP applies.

[138] Earlier, I described pages 511 to 516 as attachments to an email from a Senior Administrative Assistant within the Deputy Minister’s Office to the Executive Advisor to the Deputy Minister. On the face of the records, I cannot determine if the records were prepared by or for an agent or legal counsel for a government institution. The first part of the test is not met. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(b) of FOIP to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue. I will consider if subsection 22(c) of FOIP applies to pages 511 to 516 of the Record at Issue.

11. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 22(c) of FOIP?

[139] Corrections applied subsection 22(c) of FOIP to pages 166, 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 511 to 516, 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue. I have already found that subsection 22(a) of FOIP

applies to pages 290 to 340, 488 to 500, and 517 to 529 so I will not consider those pages here.

[140] Subsection 22(c) of FOIP provides:

22 A head may refuse to give access to a record that:

...

(c) contains correspondence between an agent of the Attorney General for Saskatchewan or legal counsel for a government institution and any other person in relation to a matter involving the provision of advice or other services by the agent or legal counsel.

[141] My office uses the following two-part test to determine if subsection 22(c) of FOIP applies:

1. Is the record a correspondence between the government institution's legal counsel (or an agent of the Attorney General) and any other person?
2. Does the correspondence relate to a matter that involves the provision of advice or other services by the agent or legal counsel?

(Guide to FOIP, Ch. 4, p. 290)

[142] Below is an analysis to determine if subsection 22(c) of FOIP applies:

- 1. Is the record a correspondence between the government institution's legal counsel (or an agent of the Attorney General) and any other person?***

[143] Page 280 of Chapter 4 of my office's *Guide to FOIP* provides the following definitions:

- "Correspondence" means letters sent or received. It is an interchange of written communication.
- "Agent" means someone who is authorized to act for or in place of another.
- "Any other person" was an intentional and inclusive phrase to capture just that – any other person. The government institution must make it sufficiently clear, as to what the nature of that other person's role in the correspondence was.

[144] Corrections did not provide an argument as to how subsection 22(c) of FOIP applies to pages 166, and 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue. Therefore, I need to determine on the face of the records if subsection 22(c) of FOIP applies to these pages.

[145] Page 166 of the Records at Issue is an email from a Corrections employee to legal counsel from the Ministry of Justice. I find that this email qualifies as correspondence between legal counsel and a Corrections employee. Therefore, this page meets the first part of the test.

[146] Pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue are attachments to an email from a Senior Administrative Assistant within the Minister's Office to the Executive Advisor to the Deputy Minister. Therefore, these pages are not correspondence between legal counsel and any other person. Therefore, these pages do not meet the first part of test. I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(c) of FOIP to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.

[147] I will continue to determine if page 166 of the Records at Issue meets the second part of the two-part test.

2. Does the correspondence relate to a matter that involves the provision of advice or other services by the agent or legal counsel?

[148] Earlier, I provided the definition of "legal advice".

[149] "In relation to" has been found to have a similar meaning as "in respect of" (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 280).

[150] "Legal service" includes any law-related service performed by a person engaged by a government institution and who is licensed to practice law (*Guide to FOIP*, Ch. 4, p. 281).

[151] Based on a review, page 166 is an email where the Corrections employee is seeking the perspective of the legal counsel regarding the drafting of a document. Therefore, the

correspondence relates to a matter that involves the provision of legal advice or services by legal counsel. Page 166 meets the second part of the test.

[152] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 22(c) of FOIP to page 166.

12. Did Corrections properly apply subsection 29(1) of FOIP?

[153] Corrections applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to pages 1, 6, 19 to 24, 29, 43, 51, 59 to 60, 70, 83, 91, 100, 102, 104, 106 to 107, 113 to 115, 119, 123 to 137, 149 to 151, 159, 177, 190, 218, 227, 229, 232 to 235, 237 to 242, 244, 246 to 252, 254 to 255, 257 to 259, 262 to 263, 347, 358, 366, 369, 376, 393, 403, 413, 437, 446, 448, 450, 453 to 455, 458 to 459, 461 to 462, 465 to 466, 468 to 469, 471 to 472, 474 to 482, 484, 486 to 487, 490, and 506 of the Records at Issue.

[154] Subsection 29(1) of FOIP provides:

29(1) No government institution shall disclose personal information in its possession or under its control without the consent, given in the prescribed manner, of the individual to whom the information relates except in accordance with this section or section 30.

[155] In order for subsection 29(1) of FOIP to apply, the withheld information must qualify as a third party's "personal information" as defined by subsection 24(1) of FOIP.

24(1) Subject to subsections (1.1) and (2), "**personal information**" means personal information about an identifiable individual that is recorded in any form, and includes:

...

(b) information that relates to the education or the criminal or employment history of the individual or information relating to financial transactions in which the individual has been involved;

...

(e) the home or business address, home or business telephone number or fingerprints of the individual;

...

(k) the name of the individual where:

(i) it appears with other personal information that relates to the individual;

[156] Corrections applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to the following types of information:

- the personal email address of the person appointed to conduct the inquiry at pages 1, 6, 43, 51, 59, 60, 70, 83, 91, 104, 106, 119, 124, 131, 149, 150, 159, 177, 190, 218, 262, 263, 347, 358, 366, 369, 376, 403, 413, 437, 490, 506 of the Records at Issue. Such information qualifies as personal information pursuant to subsection 24(1)(e) of FOIP.
- The curriculum vitae of the person appointed to conduct the inquiry at pages 125 to 130 and 132 to 137 of the Records at Issue. Such information qualifies as personal information pursuant to subsection 24(1)(b) of FOIP.
- Information regarding a personal appointment of the person appointed to conduct the inquiry at page 393 of the Records at Issue. Such information qualifies as personal information pursuant to subsection 24(1)(k) of FOIP.
- Information about the death of an individual at pages 100, 102, 227, 229, 446 and 448 of the Records at Issue. Such information qualifies as personal information pursuant to subsection 24(1)(k) of FOIP.

[157] The above types of information qualifies as personal information pursuant to subsection 24(1)(b), (e), and (k)(i) of FOIP. I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to the above types of information.

[158] However, Corrections applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to other types of information that does not qualify as personal information. For example, it applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to the business contact information, including the Applicant's business card information at pages 116, 117, 453, 454, 458, 458, 461, 462, 465, 466, 468, 469, 471, 472, 474 to 482, 487 of the Records at Issue. In my office's [Review Report 186-2019](#), I said the following regarding business card information:

Business card information is the type of information found on a business card (name, job title, work address, work phone numbers and work email address). This type of information is generally not personal in nature and therefore would not be considered personal information. Further, in Review Report 149-2019, 191-209 [sic], I noted that business card information does not qualify as personal information when found with work product. Work product is information generated by or otherwise associated with

an individual in the normal course of performing his or her professional or employment responsibilities, whether in a public or private setting. Work product is also not considered personal information.

[159] Therefore, I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 29(1) of FOIP to business card information throughout the Records at Issue. My findings and recommendations are in the Appendix.

IV FINDINGS

[160] I find that I have jurisdiction to undertake this review.

[161] I find that subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP applies to the Minister's Order (the attached schedule) and the notice of special inquiry.

[162] I find that subsection 15(1)(c) of FOIP does not apply to page 97 of the Records at Issue.

[163] I find that subsection 15(1)(k) of FOIP does not apply to page 97 of the Records at Issue.

[164] I find that Corrections has not properly applied subsection 15(1)(d) of FOIP to pages 85 to 90, 108 to 113, 121 to 123, 139 to 141, 146 to 148, 152 to 157, 180, 187 to 189, 196 to 197, 205 to 206, 208 to 209, 212 to 217, 224, 287 to 289, 345 to 346, 350 to 353, 355 to 357, 391 to 392, 400 to 401, 421 to 422, 427 to 428, 431 to 436, 443, 497 to 498, 508 to 509 of the Records at Issue.

[165] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 16(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 103, 230, and 449 of the Records at Issue.

[166] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 19, 22, 116, 232 to 233, 236 to 237, 240, 243 to 244, 248 to 249, 252, 257, 452, 457, 461, 464, 468, 470 to 471, 473, 476, 478, 481, and 485 to 486 of the Records at Issue.

- [167] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 262 to 263 of the Records at Issue.
- [168] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 8 to 15, 16 to 18, 31 to 38, 39 to 41, 47 to 50, 53 to 58, 63 to 66, 71 to 74, 75 to 77, 140 to 141, 142 to 145, 162 to 165, 183 to 186, 192 to 195, 201 to 204, 208 to 209, 220 to 223, 287 to 289, 355 to 357, 369 to 370, 372 to 375, 380 to 383, 387 to 390, 396 to 399, 406 to 409, 414 to 417, 421 to 425, 439 to 442, and 491 to 498, 502 and 504 of the Records at Issue.
- [169] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 4, 5, 26, 27, 67 to 69, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 280, 284 to 286, and 410 to 411 of the Records at Issue.
- [170] I find that Corrections did not properly subsection 17(1)(a) of FOIP to pages 25, 259, 265, 266, 273 to 274, 278 to 279, and 283 of the Records at Issue.
- [171] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 4, 5, 26, 27, 67 to 69, 266 to 268, 274 to 276, 279 to 281, 284 to 286, and 410 to 411 of the Records at Issue.
- [172] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to page 165.
- [173] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 3, 59, 104, 149, 368, and 402 of the Records at Issue.
- [174] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 17(1)(b) of FOIP to pages 44, 45, 51, 60 to 62, 368 to 370, 376 to 378, 384 to 385, 393 to 394, and 403 to 404 of the Records at Issues.
- [175] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 19(1)(b) of FOIP to the redacted contents of the email dated October 20, 2022 (timestamped 1:42pm) on pages 131, 262, and 263 of the Records at Issue.

- [176] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(a) of FOIP to pages 3, 25, 118, 266, 273, 278, 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.
- [177] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 22(a) of FOIP to pages 290 to 340, 488 to 500, 517 to 529 of the Records at Issue.
- [178] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(b) of FOIP to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.
- [179] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 22(c) of FOIP to pages 511 to 516 of the Records at Issue.
- [180] I find that Corrections properly apply subsection 22(c) of FOIP to page 166.
- [181] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to pages 1, 6, 43, 51, 59, 60, 70, 83, 91, 104, 106, 119, 124, 131, 149, 150, 159, 177, 190, 218, 262, 263, 347, 358, 366, 369, 376, 403, 413, 437, 490, 506 of the Records at Issue.
- [182] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to pages 125 to 130 and 132 to 137 of the Records at Issue.
- [183] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to pages 393 of the Records at Issue.
- [184] I find that Corrections properly applied subsection 29(1) of FOIP to pages 100, 102, 227, 229, 446 and 448 of the Records at Issue.
- [185] I find that Corrections did not properly apply subsection 29(1) of FOIP to business card information throughout the Records at Issue.

V RECOMMENDATION

[186] I recommend that Corrections comply with the recommendations set out in the Appendix, including releasing records within 30 days of issuance of this Report.

Dated at Regina, in the Province of Saskatchewan, this 11th day of December, 2023.

Ronald J. Kruzeniski, K.C.
Saskatchewan Information and Privacy
Commissioner

Appendix

Page number of Records at Issue	Records provided to the Applicant	Exemption(s) applied by Corrections	IPC Findings	IPC Recommendations
1	1	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
2	2	Released		
3	3	22(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
4	4	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
5	5	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
6	6	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
7	7	Released		

8	8	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
9	9	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
10	10	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
11	11	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
12	12	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
13	13	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
14	14	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
15	15	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
16	16	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
17	17	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
18	18	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
19	19	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the second paragraph of email timestamped 9:55:31AM.	Continue to withhold the second paragraph of email timestamped 9:55:31AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.

			29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release remainder.
20	20	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
21	21	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
22	22	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the second paragraph of email timestamped 9:55:31AM. 29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the second paragraph of email timestamped 9:55:31AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
23	23	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
24	24	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
25	25	22(a); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
26	26	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
27	27	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
28	28	Released		
29	Applicant not provided	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the	Continue to withhold personal

	a copy of page.		personal email address of appointee.	email address of appointment pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
30	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	Released – Duplicate of page 7 of “Records provided to the Applicant”		
31	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
32	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
33	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
34	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
35	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
36	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
37	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
38	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
39	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

40	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
41	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
42	29	Released		
43	30	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
44	31	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
45	32	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
46	33	Released		
47	34	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
48	35	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
49	36	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
50	37	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.

51	38	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
52	39	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
53	40	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
54	41	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
55	42	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
56	43	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
57	44	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
58	45	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
59	46	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
60	47	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email	Continue to withhold personal email address of

			address of appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
61	48	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
62	49	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
63	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
64	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
65	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
66	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
67	50	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
68	51	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
69	52	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

			17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	
70	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
71	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
72	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
73	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
74	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
75	53	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
76	54	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
77	55	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
78	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
79	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
80	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
81	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

82	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
83	56	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
84	57	Released		
85	58	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
86	59	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
87	60	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
88	61	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
89	62	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
90	63	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
91	64	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee.	Continue to withhold personal email address of appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
92	65	Released		
93	66	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
94	67	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
95	68	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
96	69	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
97	70	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

			15(1)(k) of FOIP does not apply.	
98	71	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
99	72	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
100	73	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading. 29(1) of FOIP does not apply to the remainder of the page. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
101	74	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
102	75	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in the sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response". 29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table.	Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appear sin the sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response" pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table

			17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
103	76	17(1)(a); 16(1) of FOIP	16(1) of FOIP applies the paragraph to which it was applied (middle of the page). 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the paragraph to which Corrections applied subsection 16(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
104	77	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee. 29(1) of FOIP does not apply to the name that appears in the body of the email timestamped 5:38PM	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
105	78	Released		
106	79	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
107	80	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
108	81	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
109	82	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
110	83	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
111	84	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

112	85	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
113	86	29(1); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
114	87	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
115	88	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
116	89	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the second paragraph of the email timestamped 12:05:36PM.	Continue to withhold the second paragraph of the email timestamped 12:05:36PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
117	90	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
118	91	22(a) of FOIP - Corrections indicated 22(a) of FOIP applied in error.	22(a) does not apply.	Release.
119	92	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email addresses on the page. 29(1) of FOIP does not apply to the names that appear on the page.	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
120	93	Released		
121	94	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
122	95	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
123	96	29(1); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

			15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	
124	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
125	97	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
126	98	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
127	99	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
128	100	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
129	101	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
130	102	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
131	103	29(1); 19(1)(b); 19(1)(c)(i); 19(1)(c)(ii); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of appointee. 19(1)(b) applies to redacted content in email dated October 20, 2022, timestamped 1:42PM.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Continue to withhold contents redacted pursuant to 19(1)(b) of FOIP.

			17(1)(b) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold contents redacted pursuant to 17(1)(b) of FOIP.
132	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
133	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
134	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
135	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
136	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
137	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
138	104	Released		
139	105	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
140	106	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
141	107	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

142	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
143	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
144	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
145	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
146	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
147	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
148	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
149	108	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
150	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
151	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

152	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
153	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
154	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
155	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
156	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
157	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
158	109	Released		
159	110	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.
160	111	Released		
161	112	Released		
162	113	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
163	114	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
164	115	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.

165	116	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies. 17(1)(b) of FOIP applies to the two questions in red.	Reconsider discretion and release contents in black ink. Withhold two questions in red pursuant to 17(1)(b) of FOIP.
166	117	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(c) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold.
167	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
168	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
169	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
170	118	Released		
171	119	Released		
172	120	Released		
173	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a) of FOIP	22(a) does not apply.	Release.
174	121	Released		
175	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a)	22(a) does not apply.	Release.
176	122	Released		
177	123	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
178	124	Released		
179	125	Released		

180	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	Continue to withhold the personal email addresses on the page pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.	Release.
181	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
182	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
183	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
184	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
185	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
186	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
187	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
188	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
189	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
190	126	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the	Continue to withhold the

			personal email address of the appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
191	127	Released		
192	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
193	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
194	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
195	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
196	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
197	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
198	128	Released		
199	129	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
200		Blank Page		
201	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
202	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
203	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.

204	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
205	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
206	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
207	130	Released		
208	131	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
209	132	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
210	133	Released		
211	134	Released		
212	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
213	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
214	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
215	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
216	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
217	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
218	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the

			address of the appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
219	Applicant not provided a copy of page.			Release.
220	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
221	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
222	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
223	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
224	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
225	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
226	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
227	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading. 29(1) of FOIP	Continue to withhold the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.

			<p>does not apply to the remainder of the page.</p> <p>17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.</p>	Release remainder.
228	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
229	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	<p>29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in the sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response".</p> <p>29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table.</p> <p>17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.</p>	<p>Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appear sin the sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response" pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Release remainder.</p>
230	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 16(1) of FOIP	<p>16(1) of FOIP applies the paragraph to which it was applied (middle of the page).</p> <p>17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.</p>	<p>Continue to withhold the paragraph to which Corrections applied subsection 16(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Release remainder.</p>
231	135	Released		
232	136	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold bullet

			17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to bullet points in email timestamped 10:18:11AM.	points in the email timestamped 10:18:11AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
233	137	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to bullet point in email timestamped 10:18:11AM.	Continue to withhold bullet point in the email timestamped 10:18:11AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
234	138	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
235	139	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
236	140	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 11:07:01AM.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 11:07:01AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
237	141	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email at the top of the page.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email at the top of the page pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
238	142	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
239	143	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
240	144	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 10:18:11AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.

			timestamped 10:18:11AM.	Release remainder.
241	145	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
242	146	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
243	147	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet point in the email timestamped 10:13AM.	Continue to withhold the bullet point in the email timestamped 10:13AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
244	148	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email at the top of the page.	Continue to withhold bullet points in the email at the top of the page pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
245	149	Released		
246	150	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
247	151	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
248	152	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 10:10AM and in the email timestamped 9:55AM.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 10:10AM and the email timestamped 9:55AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
249	153	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email at the top of the page.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email at the top of the page pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.

250	154	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
251	155	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
252	156	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 9:55AM.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 9:55AM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
253	157	Released		
254	158	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
255	159	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
256	160	Released		
257	161	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email at the top of the page.	Continue to withhold the bullet points at the top of the page pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
258	162	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
259	163	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
260	164	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
261 – Blank page				
262	165	29(1); 19(1)(b); 19(1)(c)(i); 19(1)(c)(ii); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) applies to body of email time stamped 7:49:54 AM 17(1)(b) applies to redacted content in email timestamped 7:44 AM	Continue to withhold redacted contents.

			<p>19(1)(b) of FOIP applies to the redacted contents of the email dated October 20, 2022 (timestamped 1:42pm).</p> <p>29(1) applies to email address in "From" field of email timestamped 1:42PM.</p>	
263	166	29(1); 19(1)(b); 19(1)(c)(i); 19(1)(c)(ii); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	<p>17(1)(a) applies to body of email time stamped 7:49:54 AM and body of email timestamped 8:08:45AM.</p> <p>17(1)(b) applies to redacted content in email timestamped 7:44 AM.</p> <p>19(1)(b) applies to redacted content in email timestamped 1:42PM.</p> <p>29(1) applies to email address in "From" field of email timestamped 1:42PM.</p>	Continue to withhold redacted contents.
264	167	Released		
265	168	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
266	169	22(a); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

			17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	
267	170	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
268	171	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
269	172	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
270	173	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
271	174	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
272	175	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
273	176	22(a); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
274	177	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
275	178	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
276	179	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

			17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	
277	180	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
278	181	22(a); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
279	182	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
280	183	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
281	184	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
282				Release
283	185	22(a); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
284	186	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
285	187	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
286	188	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
287	189	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

288	190	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
289	191	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
290	192	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
291	193	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
292	194	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
293	195	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
294	196	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
295	197	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
296	198	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
297	199	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
298	200	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
299	201	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
300	202	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
301	203	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
302	204	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
303	205	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.

304	206	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
305	207	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
306	208	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
307	209	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
308	210	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
309	211	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
310	212	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
311	213	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
312	214	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
313	215	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
314	216	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
315	217	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
316	218	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
317	219	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
318	220	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.

319	221	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
320	222	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
321	223	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
322	224	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
323	225	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
324	226	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
325	227	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
326	228	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
327	229	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
328	230	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
329	231	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
330	232	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
331	233	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
332	234	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
333	235	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.

334	236	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
335	237	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
336	238	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
337	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
338	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
339	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
340	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
341	239	Released		
342	240	Released		
343	241	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
344	242	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
345	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

346	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
347	243	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
348	244	Released		
349	245	Released		
350	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
351	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
352	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
353	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
354	246	Released		
355	247	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
356	248	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
357	249	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

358	250	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of appointee. Release remainder.
359	251	Released		
360	252	Released		
361	253	Released		
362	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
363	254	Released		
364	255	Released		
365		22(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
366	256	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to personal email address of appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of appointee. Release remainder.
367	257	Released		
368	258	17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
369	259	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
370	260	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
371	261	Released		

372	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
373	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
374	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
375	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
376	262	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
377	263	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
378	264	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
379	265	Released		
380	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
381	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.

382	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
383	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
384	266	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
385	267	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
386	268	Released		
387	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
388	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
389	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
390	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
391	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
392	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
393	269	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the

			address of the appointee. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
394	270	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
395	271	Released		
396	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
397	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
398	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
399	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
400	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
401	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
402	272	17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
403	273	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.

			17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release remainder.
404	274	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
405	275	Released		
406	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
407	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
408	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
409	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
410	276	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
411	277	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
412	278	Released		
413	279	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.

414	280	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
415	281	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
416	282	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
417	283	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
418	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
419	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
420	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
421	284	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
422	285	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
423	286	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
424	287	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
425	288	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
426	289	Released		
427	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
428	Applicant not provided	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

	a copy of page.			
429	290	Released		
430	291	Released		
431	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
432	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
433	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
434	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
435	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
436	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
437	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
438	Applicant not provided a copy of page.			Release.
439	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
440	Applicant not provided	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.

	a copy of page.			
441	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
442	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
443	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply. 15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
444	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
445	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	15(1)(c) of FOIP applies.	Reconsider discretion and release.
446	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading. 29(1) of FOIP does not apply to the remainder of the page. 17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Continue to withhold the second sub-heading on the page and the first paragraph after the second sub-heading pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.
447	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
448	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in	Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appear sin the

			<p>the sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response".</p> <p>29(1) of FOIP applies to the age and name of an individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table.</p> <p>17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.</p>	<p>sentence that comes after the sub-heading "Provincial Government Response" pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Continue to withhold the age and name of the individual that appears in the second sub-heading in the table pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Release remainder.</p>
449	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	17(1)(a); 16(1) of FOIP	<p>16(1) of FOIP applies the paragraph to which it was applied (middle of the page).</p> <p>17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.</p>	<p>Continue to withhold the paragraph to which Corrections applied subsection 16(1) of FOIP.</p> <p>Release remainder.</p>
450	292	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
451	293	Released		
452	294	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
453	295	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
454	296	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
455	297	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
456	298	Released		

457	299	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
458	300	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
459	301	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
460	302	Released		
461	303	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
462	304	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
463	305	Released		
464	306	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
465	307	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
466	308	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
467	309	Released		
468	310	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
469	311	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

470	312	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
471	313	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
472	314	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
473	315	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
474	316	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
475	317	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
476	318	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
477	319	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
478	320	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 12:06pm pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.

			timestamped 12:06pm.	Release remainder.
479	321	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
480	322	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
481	323	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 12:06pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 12:06pm pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
482	324	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
483	325	Released		
484	326	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
485	327	17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP.
486	328	29(1); 17(1)(a); 17(1)(b) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply. 17(1)(a) of FOIP applies to the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24pm.	Continue to withhold the bullet points in the email timestamped 1:24PM pursuant to 17(1)(a) of FOIP. Release remainder.
487	329	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
488	330	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
489	331	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
490	332	29(1); 22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.

491	333	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
492	334	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
493	335	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
494	336	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(c); 15(1)(k) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
495	337	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
496	338	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
497	339	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
498	340	22(a); 22(b); 22(c); 17(1)(a); 15(1)(d) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
499	341	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
500	342	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
501	343	Released		
502	344	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
503	345	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
504	346	17(1)(a) of FOIP	17(1)(a) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
505	347	Released		
506	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	29(1) of FOIP	29(1) of FOIP applies to the personal email address of the appointee.	Continue to withhold the personal email address of the appointee pursuant to 29(1) of FOIP. Release remainder.

507	Applicant not provided a copy of page.			Release
508	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
509	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	15(1)(d) of FOIP	15(1)(d) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
510	348	Released		
511	349	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply. 22(c) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
512	350	22(a); 22(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
513	351	22(a); 22(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
514	352	22(a); 22(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
515	353	22(a); 22(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.
516	354	22(a); 22(b) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP does not apply. 22(b) of FOIP does not apply.	Release.

517	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
518	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
519	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
520	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
521	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
522	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
523	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
524	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
525	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
526	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
527	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.
528	Applicant not provided	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.

	a copy of page.			
529	Applicant not provided a copy of page.	22(a); 22(b); 22(c) of FOIP	22(a) of FOIP applies.	Continue to withhold pursuant to 22(a) of FOIP.